Journal of Development and Social Sciences

www.jdss.org.pk

RESEARCH PAPER

Exploring the 'Civil Repair' Function of Media: A Case Study of The Christchurch Mosques Shootings

¹Ayaz Khan   ² Dr. Muhammad Junaid Ghauri*   ³Riffat Alam

1   MS Scholar, Department of Media and Communication Studies of the International Islamic University, Islamabad, Pakistan
2   Lecturer, Department of Media and Communication Studies at the International Islamic University, Islamabad, Pakistan
3   Assistant Professor, Department of Mass Communication at the Karakoram International University, Gilgit-Baltistan, Pakistan

PAPER INFO	ABSTRACT
	This research endeavor is an attempt to explore and analyze the discourse produced by *The New Zealand Herald*; a newspaper from New Zealand and by *The News International*; a Pakistani newspaper. The researchers intend to determine whether and to what extent both the newspapers have the role of 'civil repair' played after the Christchurch mosques shootings. The researchers have incorporated the 'lexicalization' and the 'ideological square' techniques proposed by Tuen A. van Dijk within the scope of Critical Discourse Analysis. The findings of this study show that both the selected newspapers assuming the social status of 'vital center' performed the role of 'civil repair' in the aftermath of the shootings by producing the 'solidarity discourse'. The 'solidarity discourse' has been produced in terms of the 'we-ness', harmony, understanding, and by mitigating the conflicting opinions.

Introduction

On March 15, 2019, New Zealand faced the most deadly and horror attacks in their national history. Around 1:40 PM local time on Friday a 28 years old Australian gym trainer and a right wing political activist Brenton Tarrant attacked the Al Noor Mosque in Christchurch during the Friday prayer. Tarrant killed 42 Muslims during prayer there, after 30 seconds of nonstop shootings he went back to his car parked near the mosque, picked another gun, entered in the mosque and started shooting again. He broadcasted the shootings live on the Facebook through a camera attached on his helmet (BBC, Christchurch mosque attack: Brenton Tarrant sentenced to life without parole, 2020). After leaving the AL Noor mosque, Tarrant killed another person on the roadside and arrived at the Linwood mosque where he started shootings at the attendees. One of the attendees of the mosque managed to come out from the prayer hall, snatched the gun and somehow managed to stop the attacker. Meanwhile two police officers chased and arrested the attacker. The two attacks resulted in 51 people killed (Smyth, 2019). New Zealand, which until that point had

only experienced terrorism as a 'latent threat' rather than a 'lived reality', suffered the single largest loss of lives to terrorism in its history (Macklin, 2019).

The Christchurch mosques shootings is not a single incident of its kind rather in quite a recent past there had been a Quebec City mosque shooting in 2017, London Bridge attack in 2017, Copenhagen shootings in 2015 and the Charlie Hebdo attack in 2015 which stunned the whole world. Media all around the world gave specific attention and produced certain kinds of discourses on the incidents ranging from a 'solidarity discourse' (Umber & Ghauri, 2020; Ghauri & Umber, 2019; Luengo & Ihlebaek, 2019; Ghauri, 2017) to a variety of binary discourses like; 'othering' (Umber, Ghauri & Haq, 2021; Umber & Ghauri, 2020), 'Securitization' (Ghauri, Umber & Warrich, 2020; Umber & Ghauri, 2020; Ghauri, 2019; Tsagarousianou, 2016; Mertens & Smaele, 2016; Cesari, 2010), 'political parallelism' (Umber & Ghauri, 2020; Ghauri & Umber, 2019; Ghauri, 2019a; 2019b; Ghauri & Yousaf, 2018; Ghauri, 2018; Tsagarousianou, 2016; Mertens & Smaele, 2016). In such scenarios of conflict, especially within a country, the binary discourses produced by the local press is an act equal to pouring oil on fire.

For instance, the portrayal of Islam and Muslims is a highly researched and studied area in the modern academic world. Research findings are evident that the coverage of Islam and Muslims by the global media is overwhelmed with the negativities, stereotyping and 'us' versus 'them' dichotomies (Umber, Ghauri & Haq, 2021; Ghauri & Umber, 2019a; 2019b; Poole, 2016; 2002). Generally, negativity is being explored and shared by media institutions about different ethnicities, religions, and societies all around the world. However, the sociological aspect of the role of media as suggested by Jeffrey C. Alexander (2006) in his *Civil Sphere Theory* (CST) proposes that media is a social institution and as a 'vital center' of the society also plays a significant role of the 'civil repair'. Alexander argues that the media performs this 'civil repair' role as a 'communicative institution' by producing a 'solidarity discourse' which helps in the conflict resolution and mitigating the polarization in a society especially during the times of a conflict (Alexander, 2006).

This research endeavor is an attempt to explore and to determine the 'civil repair' role performed by *The New Zealand Herald*; a newspaper from New Zealand and by *The News International*; a Pakistani newspaper in the aftermath of the Christchurch mosques shootings in 2019. The researchers intend to explore and analyze **h**ow and to what extent the selected newspapers played the role of 'civil repair' in the coverage of Christchurch mosques shootings in New Zealand during March 15, 2019, to June 15, 2019? So, the main objective of this study is to map out and to determine whether and to what extent the 'solidarity discourse' has been produced by the selected newspapers from both the countries after the shootings.

The concept of civil society was first identified by Hobbes; he identified the civil society "No law can be unfair in giving rights to its people. The law and constitutions should be made by the people who are the sovereign power, and after all that power become warranted". Here Hobbes brings the concept of civil society by saying that "all that doing

the above points then power is warranted" (Hobbes, 1958: 388). Alexander mapping out his idea of civil society is a ground for social and civil solidarity where people connected to people. Civil Society where people live under the ideas of 'we-ness' and 'connectedness'. Furthermore, Alexander meant by Civil Solidarity that people should not be divided by its ethnicity, religions, and class, etc. there should be only one group or identity and that group or identity should be only based on humanity and humans where every human live under its 'natural' rights which any division.

According to the functionalists, the civil society can be assumed as a social circle, or another system, which takes efforts from the other civil spheres and civil society can be bound to constraints and in response, it can also make efforts to constrain these other spheres. In a phenomenological sense, assumptions are provided to non-civil society from the civil society and non-civil society mostly rely on that assumptions. No doubt civil society constitutes a large part of the public life world upon which contemporary social organizations rests (Alexander, 1997).

Jeffrey C Alexander, a cultural sociologist at Yale, in 2006 published a book *The Civil Sphere*, which is the collective work of many decades exploring the "cultural structure at the heart of democratic life." Alexander's theory of the civil sphere is focused on justice and democratic institutions, in the civil sphere alexander showed seriousness about the role of communication and culture for justice and democratic societies. "real as compared to ideal civil societies" is the focus to examine communication in theory. This theory is a conceptual framework for scholars of communication studies to analyze the role of media in the struggle for civil society, and democratic societies (Forde, 2015).

Maria Luengo (2012) writes in her article about *The Civil Sphere*, in which Alexander argues about a theory for civil society, that the main concept of the theory is a cultural structure of society and the unique thing, in theory, is that it has relative relations with the instruments of society. Now at the very beginning of this theory Alexander connected the role of media and communication with culture, democracy, and justice development. The basic point of this theory is that society is based on collective mechanism, society is not based on power and self-interest, furthermore, alexander says that ideals of community and justice, integration, and feelings for others are also the pillars on which society stands. These foundations on which society is built are known as the pillars of solidarity. According to Alexander, this solidarity is "possible because people are oriented not just to the here and now but to the ideal, to the transcendence, to what they believe will be eternal." According to Alexander, "civil society discourses and structures transcend above the social constraints of daily life, enabling more universalistic civil norms for democratic critique, action, and reform." He divided the economy and politics and this separation between political, economic, and social solidarity is due to the fact that social solidarity should have a practical and deep-rooted structure in social society. Even though every civil society has civil associations and institutions and along with that it also has subjective boundaries for morality and this morality has nothing to do with external force but it is the inheritance of society itself (Luengo, 2012).

The *Civil Sphere Theory* models are at the same time opposing and parallel; this gives picture of strong feelings of freedom but at the same time it also gives concept of suppression (Alexander, 2015). The *civil sphere theory* gives chance to people to examine the nationalism and nationalists (Wood and Debs, 2013) similarly it also provide chance to work with local and settlers struggles in Europe (Trondman, 2016; Lund, 2013; Trondman et al., 2012) it changes the direction and move in a direction against multicultural incorporation in the United States (Jaworsky, 2017; 2013; Voyer, 2013) it causes division and sparks civil war in Latin America (Tognato, 2011; 2010), disputes between indigenous peoples and massacre in Canada (Woods 2016), racial differences and settlement in South Africa (Goodman, 2008), the economy and country in East Asia (Lee, 2012), the start and end of the Arab Spring (Khosrokhavar, 2015; 2012; Alexander, 2011), war (Smith, 2005), racism (Ostertag, 2017).

The 'vital center' in the context of differentiated and split civil spheres (Schlesinger, 1949, quoted in Alexander, 2016). Then comes the 'vital center' which means that it is a form of network that work in democratic behavior as an individual and at the same time also work as an institution who belong to different background and ideology but one thing is common and that is believing in the existing of civil repair by vital center after any radical, cultural and social incident. In a result it brings values to the democratic and social institutions by moving everywhere with everyone apart from ideology and difference and work for civil repair. It is journalism which has vital center in any society after any radical, cultural, and social incident and it is the duty of journalism to work for civil repair (Austin, 1962).

Jeffery C. Alexander's *Civil Sphere Theory* is a new version of civil society for the 21st century. In the civil sphere, Alexander tries to reshape the subjects of sociology. The role of communication is the center point of attention in civil sphere theory. Alexander proposes three different ideal types of civil society. The very first civil society is the collective idea of Tocqueville, Ferguson, Smith, Hegel, and Rousseau which defined civil society as a diffused community, the concept of civil society restricts the state from the civil institutions, such as capitalist market, voluntary institutions, religion, and relationship among the people on the bases of trust. (P.25). The next idea was fundamentally based on the version of Marx, which gives priority to the legal and political superstructure over the capitalist market system. This civil society was based on the solidarity and unity with the working-class or the instrumentalism of Gramsci's 'war of position' (Friedland, 2007).

The 'civil repair' brings societies together from different ideological and political perspectives, especially from different cultural and religious norms and values. In the *Civil Sphere Theory*, the process of repairing in any society is civil repair. Now repair means that if society is damaged by radical, cultural, economic, and religious incidents and as a result, it creates polarization, hate, and miseries for the people living in that civil society and which seem the destruction of society and that destruction needs to be repaired, people must connect. The anti-civil and non-civil elements should be excluded which creates polarization, discrimination, inequality, and miseries. Now, these anti-civil and non-civil

elements can be removed by using the exclusive process defined by Alexander in the civil sphere theory, that process is called civil repair. The researchers in this study intend to identify the function of media in refining and excluding the anti-civil elements from the civil society of New Zealand after the Christchurch Mosque Shootings when Media take a position of vital center and put efforts to create harmony, cohesion, and work for 'civil repair' among the Muslims and Non-Muslims communities living in New Zealand.

In the *Civil Sphere Theory* Alexander (2006) notes that the purpose or duty of the 'vital center' i.e. the media is to work for the 'civil repair'. The 'civil repair' is the function of uniting and creating the harmony or 'we-ness' in the socially dissented segments that have different ideas or feelings, especially after any radical events. The 'civil repair' brings societies together with different ideological and political perspectives especially with cultural and religious norms and values. Media primarily performs the function of the 'civil repair' by producing the 'solidarity discourse' during various conflicts. In this study, the 'civil repair' is considered as the role of the selected newspapers wherein the newspapers use words, phrases, and sentences to create the 'we-ness' by bringing Muslims and non-Muslims together after the Christchurch mosque shootings. The researchers have coded the editorials; their words, sentences and the paragraphs into the category of the 'solidarity discourse' if the overall theme is based on the words and sentences of the paragraphs which were in line with the conceptual definition of 'civil repair'.

The researchers have selected *The New Zealand Herald* from New Zealand and *The News International* from Pakistan for this study. New Zealand Media and Entertainment owns *The New Zealand Herald* which is a daily newspaper being published from Auckland. *The New Zealand Herald* has the highest circulation of any newspaper in New Zealand, with a circulation of 113,752 as of March 31st, 2018. *The New Zealand Herald* is traditionally a center-right newspaper and generally editorially progressive on international geopolitics, diplomacy, and military matters but in the past the newspaper was considered as a conservative newspaper. On the other hand, *The News International* is an English newspaper of Pakistan founded on February 11, 1991. *The News International* is published daily from Karachi, Lahore, and Rawalpindi/Islamabad. The owner of *The News International* is Jang Group of Newspapers. Their headquarters are in Karachi. *The News International* is the largest circulating English newspaper in the country with 140,000 copies being published per day. The editorial policy of *The News International* is moderate and followed by the *Jang* Group of Newspapers.

Material and Methods

Data Collection and Sampling

Using 'Christchurch mosque shootings' and 'New Zealand attack' as the keywords in the most reliable available database; the LexisNexis, the researchers collected relevant editorials from *The New Zealand Herald* and *The News International* during March 15, 2019, to June 15, 2019. Employing the census sampling technique the researchers found three

editorials on the issue published by *The News International* during the time period under study. On the other hand, *The New Zealand Herald* published eleven editorials on the issue during this time period.

For the sake of getting equal sample size, the researchers employed purposive sampling and chose two editorials from *The News International* published during the month of March. Similarly, two editorials were selected from *The New Zealand Herald* which were published during the same month. Following are the selected editorials from the two newspapers;

Editorials of *The News International*

S.No.	Headline	Date
1	**Terror in New Zealand**	March 16, 2019
2	**The lives of others**	March 25, 2019

Editorials of *The New Zealand Herald*

S.No.	Headline	Date
1	**Christchurch mosque shootings - Hate does not prosper in New Zealand**	March 17, 2019
2	**Inside world of terrorism, looking out**	March 18, 2019

Data Analyses

To analyze the collected data the researchers have employed the 'lexicalization' and the 'ideological square' devices recommended by Tuen A. van Dijk (1998) from the Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) paradigm.

Van Dijk's (1998) idea of 'ideological square', which is described by positive in-group description and negative out-group description, gives a reasonable answer to our findings. Van Dijk notes that group ideologies show the representation of 'Self' and 'Other', 'Us' and 'Them'. Many of them create polarization like 'We are Good', 'our ideology is better and They are Bad', 'They' are required to bring changes in their ideology. The 'ideological square' differentiates in- and out-groups to present the 'We' group favorite and 'They' group bad. This ideological differentiation may be applied by a large variety such as the choice of lexical items that involve positive or negative assessments, in addition to that structure of complete propositions and their types (as in active/passive, etc.). This approach of polarization consists various strategies like; (1) highlighting our good properties/actions, (2) put emphasis on their bad properties/actions, (3) justifying our bad properties/actions, and (4) deemphasizing their good properties/actions (Kuo & Nakamura, 2005).

Lexicalization is a method used to dig out and analyze the use of the lexis for the sake polarization in the text and discourse. Lexicalization is used to analyze the meanings

and contexts of words and sentences. The method of lexicalization is applied through lexical choices for example using positive and negative assessments within a text to portray 'Us' (in-group) favorably and Them (out-group) unfavorably (Umber & Ghauri, 2020).

So, keeping in view the appropriateness and suitability of the two techniques with the research objective the researchers have employed them to analyze the editorial contents of *The New Zealand Herald* and *The News International* published regarding the Christchurch mosques shootings during March 2019.

Results and Discussion

Following pages contain the analysis on the editorials published by *The News International* and by *The New Zealand Herald;*

Analysis on *The News International*

Editorial of *The News International*	
Headline	**Date**
Terror in New Zealand	March 16, 2019

The Lexical choice in this editorial such as "Terror" shows that there is fear in New Zealand after the Christchurch mosque shootings, the lexis used in the headline by the newspaper is neutral which neither represents the solidarity discourse nor supports the dichotomy and polarization.

The leading paragraph of this editorial shows that it takes a position against the white people and shows some negative by using lexical sentences such as "another white far-right terrorist attack, there is little doubt that this is 'one of New Zealand's darkest days' as its Prime Minister Jacinda Arden said, Christchurch itself has a history of far-right violence, with several violent attacks in the city since the late 1980s". These lexical sentences show that it portrays a negative image of white people, and this discourse lies in the dichotomy emphasizing and polarization, this lead paragraph inclined towards polarization and in-group. Furthermore, this editorial also criticized and show a negative image of Australia and its government over the deportations of policies by using lexis such as "who know little about the growing white fascism in places like Australia, this would be a shock, for those who have reported on growing neo-Nazi rallies in the region... Lets one forget that for almost two centuries the Australian peninsula has retained some of the most racist migration policies in the so-called developed world". This clearly shows lexically didn't support the 'Harmony' and 'We-ness' among the Muslims and Christian religious communities and as result, it supports the negative stance and as a result, creates polarization and division among the religious communities.

The Second paragraph, of this editorial represents only the Muslim community in this attack and whole white people are declared responsible for the attack on the

Christchurch Mosque shootings by using lexical items such as "this is not enough, erase the horror, none of the suspects was on the terrorist watch list, white extremists apparently cannot be terrorists, white settler governments, while there is little surprise in the failure of the Australian prime minister to call it a 'terrorist attack'." Lexically this discourse gives a negative image of the white people and intends to create polarization in society.

The last paragraph, of this editorial shows that this newspaper represents only the Muslim community by using lexical items such as "white far-right, serious terrorist, settler violence and far-right terrorism, an attack was being planned, Norwegian far-right terrorist". While the lexical choice of the editorial represents that white people are terrorists and they are a threat to the Muslims around the world and this position of the newspaper is negative which sow division among the Muslims and Christian communities and creates dichotomy and polarization among the society.

Overall in terms of ideological square this editorial represents one-sided discourse and creates polarization and the according to set rules ideologically this editorial does not support 'solidarity' and 'civil repair' but emphasizing the dichotomy and polarization.

Editorial of *The News International*

Headline	Date
The lives of others	March 25, 2019

The lexical choices of *The News International* in editorial headline such as "lives, others" show that every single life of every single person matters. Different communities are living in a society so accordingly there must be minorities in that society so there should be respect for their religion, the value should be given to their festivals. This discourse is positive and inclined towards the out-group.

The leading paragraph of the editorial has lexical items such as "otherness, non-Muslim, minority, festivals, little official recognition, Pakistan" contains the idea of 'unity' and 'we-ness' for Pakistan. This discourse defined the concept of minority, place, and space for the minority. This discourse exploring Pakistan society by using the otherness. According to the Oxford dictionary, otherness means being different from others, here this lexis shows that there is a mindset of being different in the majority group from the minority group, which unfortunately creates division in the segments of society, this division leads society to chaos and during the chaos rights of minority violates. Furthermore, lexis contains that in Pakistan there is very little official recognition for the festivals of minorities, which makes hurdle for the minority to work for the construction of society. This discourse is based on 'solidarity' and 'unity'. This discourse asks communities for unity and harmony, so this discourse works for 'civil repair' and lies in 'them'.

The second paragraph of this editorial has chosen lexical items such as "praise for New Zealand, Jacinda Arden, she and her country deserve this praise, Christchurch massacre, Muslims around the world, white supremacist fanatic, forced conversion, murder

of Ahmadis, uncommon event" contains that we must learn from the Kiwis and the Prime Minister of New Zealand Jacinda Arden that who they treated Muslims a minority group after an attack on the Muslims. This behavior of Kiwis and Prime Minister Jacinda Arden teaches the world that everyone should have to treat their minority with respect and let them live with dignity. The Kiwis supported the Muslim community after a white supremacist killed them. This editorial shows that there is injustice with minorities of Pakistan. In Pakistan there is force conversation of Religion and attacks on the religious places of the minority which must be stopped and minorities should be treated respectfully, and let them live with dignity and pride. This discourse is out-group which supports 'solidarity' and 'civil repair'.

The last paragraph of this editorial has chosen lexical items such as "social construct, happiness, public space, diverse nation" shows that Pakistan was a diverse nation but now it is changed, there is no tolerance and acceptance. Lexically, this discourse contains that Pakistan will be happy and there will be social construction if there is no concept of otherness instead minority groups are treated with respect and dignity. This discourse inclined towards 'civil repair', 'harmony', and 'we-ness'.

In term of Ideological Square, the newspaper has chosen lexical items such as "lives of people who are equal citizens of the state of Pakistan essentially go ignored... They have brought some light into the lives of those living in New Zealand and reminded them that the people of that country do not stand with the white supremacist fanatic who carried out the killings portrayed" the image of Pakistan societal behavior with minority, which is not so good and the concept of othering still exists and this is a threat to the diverse Pakistan and threat to the life of the minority. Government and the Society of Pakistan should have to learn from the behavior of Prime Minister Jacinda Arden and the New Zealanders. The support of New Zealanders to Muslims is exemplary. This discourse is creating 'cohesion' among the communities of Pakistan and works for 'civil repair' and 'connectivity'.

The overall, theme of the editorial is positive and connecting. Although there is some lexis whose literal meaning is negative the use of that lexis in sentences gave positive meaning. There is the concept of otherness in Pakistan society, which is dangerous and must be dealt with, with special care. This discourse is inclined towards 'we-ness' and 'harmony'.

Analysis on *The New Zealand Herald*

Editorial from *The New Zealand Herald.*	
Headline	**Date**
Christchurch mosque shootings - Hate does not prosper in New Zealand	March 17, 2019

The lexical items chosen in the headline of the editorial such as "Hate, does not prosper" portrays that there is no place for hate among communities of New Zealand, the

aims of attackers were creating fear, hate, and polarization among the communities but here the lexis used in the headline of this editorial failed the attackers to achieve their aims and clearly says that Hate will not have place and prosperity in New Zealand. Although the literal meaning of Hate is negative lexically it gives positive meaning in the headline.

The leading Paragraph of this editorial used lexical items such as "sick intentions, united New Zealander, our Muslim community is very much a part of who we are" clearly saying that there is no space for the motives of the attacker in the newspaper. Lexically "sick intentions" mean that the motives and aims of the attacker are sick intentions, furthermore, lexis "Our New Zealander, our Muslim community is very much a part of who we are", are used to shows that people of New Zealand stands firm with the Muslim community of New Zealand in this testing time.

The second paragraph of this editorial chose lexical items such as "hopefully not in New Zealand, blessedly free of the hatred generated, far right of politics, terrorism in the name of Islam, to blame them or their religion is as absurd" which supports the narrative of Muslims in New Zealand. "blessedly free of the hatred generated" lexis shows that it is considered a blessing that generation rejects the hate against the Muslims community and as a result the motive and aims attacker destroyed. similarly, "terrorism in the name of Islam" is a phrase that lexically inclined to give support and stand with the Muslim community because there is terrorism on the name of Islam but Islam and all Muslim are not terrorists, another lexical used that is "to blame them or their religion is as absurd" here word them is used for Muslims and which clearly says that blaming all Muslims and there is an illogical and irresponsible act.

The last paragraph, of this shows by lexical items such as "Hate does not prosper here, harbor an ugly, not given newspaper space, politely avoided, the haters have made an impact but not the one they wanted, immigrant cultures and brought us closer to the Muslims in our midst, loss will never be forgotten, we share it, this has become their country too" this editorial have soft heart and words for the Muslim community in New Zealand after the Christchurch Mosque Shootings. "not given newspaper space" newspaper clearly says that there is no space and words for hate in this newspaper, furthermore, "the haters have made an impact but not the one they wanted" this phrase lexically damaged the idea and hatred against the Muslim and says that New Zealanders failed the attackers in his motives. Similarly, "immigrant cultures brought us closer to the Muslims in our midst, loss will never be forgotten, we share it, this has become their country" there are very simple, clear shows sympathy to Muslims community, we share it, and this has become their country.

The ideological square of this editorial shows by using lexical items such as the "Prime Minister put it so well, "They have chosen to make New Zealand their home, and it is their home. They are us"... To blame them or their religion is as absurd as it would be to blame New Zealand for this crime.... Those who harbor an ugly dislike of different races, religions, and cultures, live on the margins of public acceptance, not given newspaper space,

the haters have made an impact but not the one they wanted". shows that the discourse of the editorial is solidarity. After all, this editorial has written that there is no space for hate, Muslims are closer to us, this is their own country and their loss will never be forgotten. This discourse inclined towards the 'Solidarity', 'Harmony', 'We-ness' and connecting religious communities of New Zealand.

Editorial from *The New Zealand Herald*

Headline	Date
Inside world of terrorism, looking out	March 18, 2019

The lexical items used by the newspaper in a headline such as "world, terrorism, looking out" shows that we are living in a terrorist world, most of us are terrorists in one or another ideological shape, and as we are living in a terrorist world we are also looking out for the peaceful world. The terrorist world and peaceful world are contradictory to each other. The existence of one is dangerous for the other, so the lexically headline shows that we must come out of this terrorist world and move towards a peaceful world, where everyone should respect each other ideology, race, religion, etc.

The leading paragraph contains lexical items such as "wounded, shattered, our Muslim community, trauma-touched, isolation, offering sympathy, dissecting a terror attack, Kiwi Muslims, countries of conflict" shows that Muslims community of New Zealand is hurt and rest of communities are shattered after the Christchurch Mosque Shootings, they are supporting Muslims in one or another way. Non- Muslim communities of New Zealand are offering sympathies to Muslims and on the other side, they are disowning terrorists and their terrorized activities. The Non-Muslim communities are calling Muslims of New Zealand their own "Kiwi Muslims". Lexically this discourse supports 'solidarity' and rejects the dichotomy and 'polarization'.

The third paragraph of the newspaper has lexis contains the idea of unity and ask the international community to destroy the infrastructure of extremism because there are group of people, institutions, and organizations that directly and indirectly supports this white supremacists' ideology. Using these lexical such as "far-right infrastructure, extremist ideas, sustenance, fringe, like-minded, cocoons, white supremacists" shows that this discourse contains the concept of 'solidarity'.

The last paragraph has lexis such as "angry, disaffected men, extremist groups, violent ideology of White supremacy, White ISIS, we can be proud, Kiwis aided victims" clearly show the anger of Muslim and at the same time, it shows that how Kiwis support their Muslim community in testing time, along with also rejected the White supremacists' ideology.

In terms of Ideological Square, the newspaper has portrayed the basic concept of unity and we-ness by using lexical items such as "Intelligence services will have to say why the suspect was not on a watch list and why his extensive social-media presence did not

raise red flags... The New Zealand massacre was livestreamed on Facebook, announced on 8chan, reposted on YouTube... Internationally, there is a far-right infrastructure of politicians, donors, commentators, media, and internet groups pushing nationalism, racism, and Islamophobia... It's easy to look for danger in outsiders when a homegrown menace is usually more likely", they are accepting and asking about the failure of security agencies and on the other asking the international community to work on the extraction of white supremacist ideology and support Muslims in this testing period. This discourse is inclusive and inclined towards 'solidarity' and 'unity'.

The overall theme of this editorial is based on the 'unity' and 'we-ness' among the Muslims and other communities in society. This discourse creates 'harmony' and 'cohesion' among the communities of New Zealand. This discourse negates the dichotomy and polarization.

Discussion

After analyzing the editorials of *The New Zealand Herald* and *The News International* on the Christchurch Mosque Shootings in New Zealand the findings show that both the selected newspapers; *The New Zealand Herald* and *The News International* performed the role of 'civil repair' by producing the 'solidarity discourse' in the aftermath of the shootings. Bothe the newspapers assumed the social status of 'vital center' by mitigating the differences between the in-group and the out-group.

Van Dijk's (1998) idea of 'ideological square', which is described by in-group description and out-group description, gives a reasonable answer to our findings. The in-group of this study is the perpetrator a white supremacist Brenton Tarrant who killed 51 Muslims in Mosque during Friday prayer, those who support white supremacist ideology, and other than that supporting 'polarization' and dichotomy discourse are also included in in-group. Brenton Tarrant is from the majority side of the population of New Zealand. While the out-group contains the Muslim community of New Zealand and the victims of shootings in Mosques. Out-group contains 'civil repair' 'solidarity' 'unity' 'we-ness' and 'connectivity' among the communities of New Zealand. The out-group is the minority group of New Zealand.

After analyzing the data of this study, the editorials of the newspapers have 'solidarity' and 'civil repair' discourse. The editorials of *The New Zealand Herald* completely disowned the attacker and in-group and supported, owned the Muslim community and out-group as a result it worked for 'civil repair' and 'unities' the Muslim and other community of New Zealand. While the newspaper from Pakistan *The News International* contains the discourse of 'solidarity' for Muslims of New Zealand and support the New Zealand after the Christchurch Mosque Shootings. "The lives of others" (March 25, 2019) headlined by the editorial of *The News International* contains the discourse of 'solidarity' and 'civil repair'.

Conclusion

At the outset of this study research question was devised by the researchers; how and to what extent the selected newspapers played the role of 'civil repair in the coverage of Christchurch Mosque Shootings in New Zealand during March 15, 2019, to June 15, 2019? The findings show that the selected newspapers for this study contain the solidarity discourse. The 'solidarity' discourse works for the 'civil repair'. The editorials of the selected newspapers contain the 'civil repair' in the form of 'solidarity', 'sympathy', and 'support'. The editorials of the selected newspapers have given a lot of space to the 'positive', 'solidarity' and 'sympathy' words and phrases, which contains the Kiwis support for the Muslim community after the Christchurch Mosque Shootings, and as result, it failed the attacker and his ideology. It is the target of the attacker and somehow natural reaction after any deadly attack in society, that creates hate among people and communities, in a result it divides people, which shattered the thought and ideas of people for each other. Comparatively, on the other side if there is work for 'civil repair' in one form or another then people, communities, and society can collectively fail the set targets of the attacker and also halts the natural reaction. The coverage of selected newspapers to Christchurch Mosque Shootings shows that the editorial and opinion has played a very important role for 'civil repair'. The result of 'civil repair' brings victims Muslim and other communities of New Zealand together with more 'unity' and 'strength'. The 'we-ness' in New Zealand is in the words of Imam Gamal Fouda, "New Zealand is unbreakable. We are broken-hearted but not broken".

On a final note, Jeffery C. Alexander (2006) presented the *Civil Sphere Theory* in his book "The Civil Sphere" in 2006 and gave the concept of media's position of 'vital center' after any radical, cultural, and religious incident and then working for 'connectivity', 'solidairty', 'we-ness', 'unity', and, 'harmony' called 'civil repair' among the groups, communities of society (Alexander, 2016). The researchers in this study during March 15, 2019, to June 15, 2019, selected *The New Zealand Herald* and *The News International* for editorials to analyze the discourse produced for Christchurch Mosque Shootings in New Zealand. While analyzing the Editorial of selected newspapers, the researcher has found out *The New Zealand Herald* and *The News International* have substantially produced the 'solidarity' discourse. The results show that the media performed a 'solidarity' 'consensus' role in Charlie Hebdo (Luengo & Ihlebæk, 2019). Similarly, the findings of analyzed data in this study show that discourse produced by the selected newspapers is 'positive', 'out-group', 'civil repair', 'solidarity', and 'harmony'. The editorials of newspapers supported the out-group and show sympathy to the Muslim community of New Zealand. The selected newspapers have soft coverage for minority victims in Christchurch Mosque Shootings.

References

Alexander, J. C. (1997). The paradoxes of civil society. *International Sociology*, *12*(2), 117-118.

Alexander, J. (1998). *Real civil societies: Dilemmas of institutionalization* (Vol. 48). SAGE Publications Limited.

Alexander, J. C. (2006). *The Civil Sphere.* Oxford University Press.

Alexander, J. C. (2016). Progress and disillusion: Civil repair and its discontents. *Thesis Eleven*, *137*(1), 72-82.

Alexander, J. C. (2004). Cultural Pragmatics: Social performance between ritual and strategy. *Sociological theory*, *22*(4), 527-573.

Alexander, J. C. (2011). *Performative revolution in Egypt: An essay in cultural power*. Bloomsbury Academic.

Alexander, J. C. (2015). Nine theses on the civil sphere. *Solidarity, Justice, and Incorporation: Thinking through The Civil Sphere*, 172-189.

Austin J (1962). *How to Do Things with Words*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Besley, T. & Peters, M. A. (2020). Terrorism, trauma, tolerance: Bearing witness to white supremacist attack on Muslims in Christchurch, New Zealand, *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 52:2, 109-119

BBC. (2020, August 27). *Christchurch mosque attack: Brenton Tarrant sentenced to life without parole*. BBC English: https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-53919624

BBC. (27 August 2020). *Christchurch mosque attack: Brenton Tarrant sentenced to life without parole.* BBC English.

Becker E (2015). *Making a case for the 'open' mosque as methodology: Muslim leaders as agents in challenging boundaries to belonging.* Policy Trajectories: Blog of the American Sociological Association's Section in Comparative and Historical Sociology.

Cesari, J. (2010). Securitization of Islam in Europe . In J. Cesari, *Muslim in the West after 9/11* (pp. 9-27). New York: Routledge.

Every-Palmer, S. Cunningham, R. Jenkins, M. & Bell, E. (2020, June 23). The Christchurch mosque shooting, the media,and subsequent gun control reform in New Zealand: a descriptive analysis. *Psychiatry, Psychology and Law*, 12.

Forde, K. R. (2015). JCI, Civil Sphere Theory Issue. *ournal of Communication Inquiry*, *39*(2), 111–112

Ghauri, M. J. Umber, S. & Warrich, H. (2020). "Securitization" of Islam and Muslims in the Australian Newspapers: A Critical Discourse Analysis. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review.* 4(3), 244-255.

Ghauri, M. J. & Umber, S. (2019). A Critical Discourse Analysis of the National Islam and Foreign Islam in the Australian Press. *Islamic Studies, 58*(3), 403-422.

Ghauri, M. J. & Umber, S. (2019). Exploring the Nature of Representation of Islam and Muslims in the Australian Press. *SAGE Open, 9*(4), 1-9.

Ghauri, M. J. (2019). Representation of Islam and Muslims in the Australian Press: Exploring the "Securitization" Discourse. *Journal of Peace Development and Communication.* 3(2), 76-98.

Ghauri, M. J. (2019a). Islam and Muslims in the Australian Press: Exploring the 'Political Parallelism' Discourse. *Journal of Communication and Religion,* 42(4), 74-87.

Ghauri, M. J. (2019). "Political Parallelism" and the representation of Islam and Muslims in the Australian Press. *SEARCH Journal of Media and Communication Research*. 11(2). 21-37.

Ghauri, M. J. (2018). 'Political parallelism' and the Representation of Islam and Muslims in the Australian Press: A critical discourse Analysis. *International Journal of Crisis Communication*. 2. 38-45.

Ghauri, M. J. & Yousaf, Z. (2018). Exploring the Political Parallelism discourse on Representation of Islam and Muslims in the Australian Press. *Journal of Peace Development and Communication.* 2(2), 54-79.

Ghauri, M. J. (2017). Discourses on Islam and Muslims in Australia. *Journal of Political Studies*, 24(2), 641:660.

Goodman, T. Eyerman, R. & Alexander, J. C. (2015). *Staging solidarity: Truth and reconciliation in a new South Africa*. Routledge.

Hobbes, Thomas (1958) *Leviathan.* New York: Atheneum

Jaworsky, B. N. (2013). Immigrants, aliens and Americans: Mapping out the boundaries of belonging in a new immigrant gateway. *American Journal of Cultural Sociology*, *1*(2), 221-253.

Jaworsky, B. N. (2017). *The boundaries of belonging: Online work of immigration-related social movement organizations*. Springer.

Khosrokhavar F (2012) The New Arab Revolutions That Shook the World. New York: Routledge.

Khosrokhavar, F. (2015). The Civil Sphere and the Arab Spring. *Solidarity, justice, and incorporation: thinking through the civil sphere*, 142-71.

Kuo,S,H & Nakamura, M. (2005). Translation or transformation? A case study of language and ideology in the Taiwanese press. *Discourse & Society 16(3)*, 410.

Luengo, M. (2012). Narrating civil society: A new theoretical perspective on journalistic autonomy. *Communication & Society*, *25*(2), 29-56.

Lund, A. (2013). Staging gender: the articulation of tacit gender dimensions in drama classes in a Swedish context. *Gender and education*, *25*(7), 907-922.

Luengo, M. & Ihlebæk, K. A. (2019). Journalism, solidarity and the civil sphere: The case of Charlie Hebdo. *European Journal of Communication*, *34*(3), 6-7.

Lee, H. J. (2012). *Discourses of civil society in South Korea: democratisation in an emerging information society* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Birmingham).

Macklin, G. (2019). *The Christchurch Attacks: Livestream Terror in the Viral Video Age*. Combating Terrorism Center.

Mertens, S. & Smaele, H. D. (2016). *Representations of Islam in the News: a cross-cultural analysis.* Maryland-USA: Lexington Books.

Ostertag, S. F. & Diaz, L. (2017). A critical strong program: Cultural power and racialized civil exclusion. *American Journal of Cultural Sociology*, *5*(1), 34-67.

Poole, E. (2002). *Reporting Islam: Media representations of British Muslims.* London: I.B. Tauris.

Poole, E. (2016). The United Kingdom's Reporting of Islam and Muslims; Reviewing the Field. In S. Mertens, & H. D. Smaele (Eds.), *Representations of Islam in the News: a cross-cultural analysis* (pp. 21-36). Maryland-USA: Lexington Books.

Smyth, G. (2019, May 5). What happened at Christchurch Hospital on the day of the mosque shootings. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6aUioNuhAfE&t=

Trondman, M. Taha, R. & Lund, A. (2012). For Aïsha: On identity as potentiality. *Identities*, *19*(4), 533-543.

Tognato, C. (2010). Performing 'legitimate'torture: Towards a cultural pragmatics of atrocity. *Thesis Eleven*, *103*(1), 88-96.

Tognato, C. (2011). Extending trauma across cultural divides: On kidnapping and solidarity in Colombia. *Narrating Trauma: Studies in the Contingent Impact of Collective Suffering*, 191-212.

Trondman M (2016) Towards an understanding on the meaning/significance of multicultural incorporation for school achievement. In: Lund A and Lund S (eds) School Achievement in the Multicultural Society. Lund: Student litteratur [in Swedish], 337–359.

Trondman, M. Taha, R. & Lund, A. (2012). For Aïsha: On identity as potentiality. *Identities*, *19*(4), 533-543.

Tsagarousianou, R. (2016). Muslims in Public and Media Discourse in Western Europe: The Reproduction of Aporia and Exclusion. In S. Mertens, & H. D. Smaele (Eds.), *Representations of Islam in the News: a cross-cultural analysis* (pp. 3-20). Maryland-USA: Lexington Books.

Umber, S. & Ghauri, M. J. (2020). Representation of Islam and Muslims in the Australian Newspapers: Exploring the Predominant Discourses. *Journal of Islamic Thought and Civilization*, *10*(2), 127-146.

Umber, S. Ghauri, M. J. & Haq, A. (2021). Exploring the Othering Discourse in the Australian Press. *Journal of Media & Communication*, 2(1), 52-67.

Van Dijk, T. A. (1993). Principles of critical discourse analysis. *Discourse & society*, *4*(2), 249.

Van Dijk, T. A. (1993). Principles of critical discourse analysis. *Discourse & Society*, *4*(2), 277.

Van Dijk, T. A. (1995). Amis of Critical Discourse analysis. *Japanese Discourse*, 17-18. Van Dijk, T. A. (2006). Politics, ideology, and discourse.

Van Dijk, T. A. (2008). 18 Critical discourse analysis. *The Handbook of Discourse Analysis*, 352-353.

Van Dijk, T. A. (1993). Principles of critical discourse analysis. *Discourse & society*, *4*(2), 249-283.

Van Dijk, Teun (1996). 'Discourse, Power and Access', in Carmen Rosa Caldas-Coulthard and Malcolm Coulthard (eds) *Texts* and *Practices: Readings* in *Critical Discourse Analysis,* pp. 84-104. London: Routledge.

Voyer, A. M. (2013). *Strangers and neighbors: Multiculturalism, conflict, and community in America*. Cambridge University Press.

Woods, E. T. & Debs, M. (eds) (2013) Themed section on cultural sociology and nation states. *Nations and Nationalism* 19(4): 607–695.

Woods, E. T. (2016). *A cultural sociology of Anglican mission and the Indian residential schools in Canada: The long road to apology*. Springer.