



RESEARCH PAPER

Impact of Devolution of Power on School Education Performance in Sindh after 18th Constitutional Amendment

¹ Abdul Hafeez ²Dr. Saima Iqbal* ³ Muhammad Imran

1. Ph. D Scholar Shaheed Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto Institute of Science & Technology, Karachi, Sindh, Pakistan
2. Assistant Professor Benazir Bhutto Shaheed University, Lyari, Karachi, Sindh, Pakistan
3. Ph. D Scholar Shaheed Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto Institute of Science & Technology, Karachi, Sindh, Pakistan

PAPER INFO	ABSTRACT
<p>Received: July 20, 2021</p> <p>Accepted: October 21, 2021</p> <p>Online: October 24, 2021</p> <p>Keywords: 18th Constitutional Amendment, Devolution of Power, Sindh Education Performance</p> <p>*Corresponding Author:</p> <p>rajputahafeez@gmail.com</p>	<p>Devolution of the authority from central units of empowering authorities to the local level to develop and exercise policies at local or organizational level is under debate in various countries of the world. The legation in with the name of 18th constitutional amendment in constitution of 1973 of Pakistan ensures more autonomy to federal units. The difference between province and federation mostly creates misunderstanding in the belief of cooperation and universalism of education standards, expenditures and service delivery. Very currently the ministry of education and local government encoring principles and headmasters to adopt self-management skills to be updated to accept the spin of power from higher authorities to lower authorities' pedagogical and local schools. In this qualitative research semi structured questioner were incorporated as data collection tool equally, the data was analyzed by usage of NVivo software. In this regard Government of Sindh has introduced various reforms and new trends like objectives and policy pillars, better government schools, improved learning outcomes and increased and improved funding in the education sector Sindh government has so far been unable to effectively use its resources to implement effective governance system which provides quality and sustained education in the province. To achieve this basic universal education, equally fourth objective of Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) the educational leaders must develop a comparative education setup that help to educate planers to plan and design standards for school leaders, instruction, appropriate professional development of teachers, ways to support school leaders to change in mission. Parallel, develop new program for early childhood, school and class size and ensure school enrollment.</p>

Introduction

Devolution of authority is the spin of power of policy making and implementation from federating units to province to attempt multiple methods and techniques to deal major issues of policy development and improve quality of service delivery according to

the needs of locality (Reynolds .R., 2008). In the devolution of power process legislation results in understanding and develops a framework among the public institutions to exercise the authority with in defined criteria at provincial level or subunit level (Gibson. D. & Goldring. E. 2001). In Germany the decentralization at broader level developed cooperation among the policy development and execution houses rather than contested (Rodden, 2003; Cole, 2006). Decentralization improves the efficiency especially in the developing states in the policies of making efficient of public goods and services delivery, microeconomics; regionalism (Oates 2005). Decentralization affects the economic, culture and politics of the domain by introducing new policies and standards of achievements (Miron & Nelson 2002). After devolution of power in England, Wales's government attempted different methods to introduce reforms in different public service sectors especially in field of education (Gerschon 2004). The difference between province and federation mostly creates misunderstanding in the belief of cooperation and universalism of education standards, expenditures and service delivery (Reynolds .R., 2008). Very currently the ministry of education and local government encoring principles and headmasters to adopt self-management skills to be updated to accept the spin of power from higher authorities to lower authorities' pedagogical and local schools (Selfi, 2012). The legation in with the name of 18th constitutional amendment in constitution of 1973 of Pakistan ensures more autonomy to federal units. The amendment gives various implications in education department additionally; the federation authorized provincial educations systems to develop curriculum, syllabus, centers of excellence; standards of education and other policies in education sector parallel to other departments (SESP, 2018). This is a big step forward for education in the aftermath of inclusion of education in the concurrent legislative list it had remained a joint function, federal as well as provincial (I-SAPS, 2010) .

Literature Review

Over the past decade a bulk of empirical research on understanding educational leadership trends and management practices has emerged mainly in the developed world (Jantzi & Steinback, 2000) which provides a variety of conceptual models and theories of educational leadership trends rooted in Western culture and context. In the field of education throughout the history of Pakistan, Every regime developed and formulated long term and short term plans, programs and policies to meet the international demand and constitutional commandment to provide basic and compulsory education to the people to achieve professional requirements of the country (Bangali, 1994). For policy development and discussion about the governance of education the role of entire government; federal, provincial and district is not clear. There are various complexities, particularly at the district or provincial level after devolution plan mostly because the latter was not stressed by a clear persuasive of policies (NEP 2009). In the education field the leadership has been charged with poor performance overall in their respective units of education (Heck, 2015). There is a tendency towards 'reliance on new panaceas', noted as early as half a century ago (Stephens, 1967).

Decentralization: an International Perspective

Devolution of the authority from central units of empowering authorities to the local level to develop and exercise policies at local or organizational level are under debate

in various countries of the world (Bardhan, 2000). There is big change in the managerial styles and hierarchies in industrial sector especially in United States of America (USA) after World War- I and especially after World War -II in industrial sector. Some of the new concepts and theories of management were introduced to run the organizations. Among these theories and styles Frederick Taylor's scientific management techniques is important, according to this Taylor's management techniques, worker should perform specific tasks (Owens, 1987; Snauwaert, 1993). Many of the countries applied these managerial styles in the schools. The schools following such managerial system needed decentralized bureaucratic system and other central office persons to carry out such policies of boards for schools and colleges. However, the previous models of the management in the education organizational structures were largely criticized at national-level and local-level. In this critic it was emphasized that the schools and colleges needed specific governance models rather than factory management models (Horgan, 1996). This criticism at large scale emphasized policy makers to debate on decentralization concerning such issues as democratic leadership, shared decision-making, and greater professional autonomy for educational respondents (Walberg & Paik, 2000). Hence this globalized concept emphasizes decision makers and analysts to revise the achievements of educational system worldwide to develop governance system in field of education that should be on the bases of problem solving, task performance and team work in the modern system of information economy in local conception (McDonnell 1989).

Educational Policies and Practices in Sindh Province after 18th Amendment

18th constitutional amendment in constitution of Pakistan ensures the abolition of federal ministry of education and the education authority completely transferred to the provinces. This amendment encircled the provinces to provide basic and compulsory education for all children of age between 5 to 16 years. In this regard government of Sindh put the first step after devolution of power developed Sindh Education Sector Plan (SESP) policy document, ever first policy draft to run the education sector according (SESP 2014). The draft were constitute in the guidance of the National Education Policy (NEP, 2009), equally the policy document represents a significantly new vision of education goals and possibilities specific to the rapidly evolving context of education sector of province.

After 18th Constitutional Amendment Transformational Programs Developed by Sindh Government

The institutional reform especially decentralization of power may be used as instrument in the process of national development equally in reorganization of government functionaries (Conyers, 1984). Henceforth this concept of decentralization can be examined in terms of degree and territorial space. The level of decentralization can be viewed on a continuum linking the transfer of decision-making authority from the central power units to the local or operational levels (Rondinelli, 1981; Conyers, 1983). Furthermore, Rondinelli (1981) elucidates that the deconcentrating involves the transfer of tasks and workload to subnational units rather than transfer of decision making authority in the respective organization or department. Hence the central unit of the power is thus decongested but there is no significant redistribution of authority. However he believes that some time delegation is the transfer of decision-making authority from national to sub-national levels processes (Rondinelli, 1981).

Meanwhile the completion of constitutional requisites of devolution of power, the provincial government with the collaboration of development partners had designed various programs and developed policies to take into account existing capacity within the system. It was difficult for the provincial government to own a bigger domain of education and run it smoothly (World Bank Report 2017). In the binging of the situation the development partners treated to function in a systematic way. Prior the functions of system are to monitor accountability, implementation and performance besides teachers and students attendance, independent monitors being monitor under the supervision of Directorate General of Monitoring and Evaluation with the help of World Bank Technical Assistance besides, Sindh School Monitoring System brings together technology and a robust accountability mechanism to address long-standing governance issues in education system of the province (World Bank Report 2017). According to the National Education Conference (NEC, 2011) in the education sector of the province at the beginning after devolution of power the attitudes adopted by educational leaders towards the organizational chart of power and authority distribution in education sector was newfangled. In the situation the National Educational Policy 2009 continued to guide education at provincial levels (NEC 2011). At this time after appreciative initiative taken by the leadership the main challenge for them that were poor access to educational opportunities and poor quality of education attributed to gaps between commitments and implementation identified by the National Educational Policy NEP 2009. Because of this the education leadership of the province developed and recommended policy actions to achieve universal and free primary education by 2015 parallel promote equity in education; commit to achieving EFA and MDGs and SDGs in the sector to improve quality of education through establishing monitoring and inspection systems (NEP 2009; SESP, 2014-18).

Institutional Autonomy and Self-Management Schools

In fact institutional autonomy is in which role holders take decisions and execute them during their work without requiring the direction of the central authorities, otherwise this is the degree of dependence of the operational level. Equally, playing a similar role, take a different measure of decision making or direct or indirect influencing on decision making in organization is also counted as dependence (Selfi, 2012). He further elaborates that in educational institutions the independence of management can be extremely effective to define the employee's/teacher's autonomy as the degree to which he is authorized or sees himself authorized to initiate, decide and execute decisions independently, without the need for confirmation from higher ranks at all levels having the idea of vision and mission of the organization (Selfi, 2012). The administration of school enjoys maximum flexibility in using a diversity of resources available to improve and advance his pedagogic achievements underlying self-management is a broad consensus regarding delegating economic measures, authority in personnel organizational, and financial issues which are all internal equally flexible administrative culture to updating itself easily in a system that adapt internal and external changes in the organizational environment, quickly and effectively (Friedman, 1995).

Community Participation in School Administrative Affairs is a Concept of Decentralization

For the devolution of the of power one relationship that has not been fully explored in previous studies is the development of role of external facilitators, who are involved with the change process but are not members of the school community, as they interact with and influencing the developing roles of teachers and administrators in decision making process of school. Broadly revealed sequencers such as the coalition of essential schools and the network of accelerated schools often utilize external facilitators to coach, provide resources and information or to create opportunities for all school participants to meet together to share experiences. Additionally, conceptions of school-university collaborations involve inter institutional arrangements that may be unfamiliar to organizations or individuals, thus leading more to conflict than to collaboration among the teachers, community and administration of schools (Clift & Say, 1986).

Decentralization

In relations of expanse of administration, it can be defined as the decentralization is a delegation of powers from authorities of new developed or existing institutes that operate nationally; a transfer to existing regional and local units or the transfer to newly created regional and local units of the organization (Rondinelli, 1981). Decentralization is a process of the scattering or circulation of jobs and authorities; precisely, the allocation of power from central authorities to local authorities, (Oxford dictionary). Obviously, the decentralization is prescribed as it is enhancement of the limits of decision making powers. Additionally, the decentralization is better to suggest that it is a process of minimizing the influence of the central governing bodies, by disintegrating the central authority to introducing local authority's to enhance the culture of competition and accountability among the authorized units (Bardhan, 2000). The main part of the literature explains the stability of leadership is the outcome of devolution of power in organizations because they enjoy the opportunity to exercise the powers frequently and carefully (Tarrow, 1978).

International Agencies and Devolution of Power in Pakistan

In education sector of Pakistan there are many projects and programs had been initiated with the collaboration between the government and development partners (National and International Non-Government Organizations NGOs), like to implement Social Action Program (SAP) and the Education Sector Reform (RSU, 2001-2004). Due to this collaboration, many NGOs introduced new leadership styles and roles at the grassroots level in the education department (Memon & Mithani, 2003). The Aga Khan Foundation, Pakistan (AKF,P), United States Agency for International Development (US-AID) parallely UNESCO collaboratively helped out technically and financially to promoting the education of pre and primary school education focusing on the rural and semi-urban areas of Sindh province (Memon & Mithani, 2003). In Pakistan many NGOs are playing their part in providing education to the children of the country, non-formal education centers were developed at taluka level to change the life of children of poor families who cannot afford the expensive education. In the country the role of NGOs in education is important because of poor education status in country having poor infrastructure, non-satisfactory teaching staff, no involvement nor interest shown by neither parents, no inclination to the importance of

education, no industries nor opportunities for the educated personnel that downs the interest of education in the society (Javed, 2012). Bano (2008) incorporates that the School Management Committees (SMCs) and Village Education have been made into legal bodies that contribute in monitoring, maintain records, and mobilizing the community had been introduced by the NGOs or with the advice of NGOs in education sector of Pakistan. These independent organizations and government joined as partners because these organizations have ability to develop resource easily to access the communities in remote areas with good communication skills and proper organized in terms of paper work and material. Latter these organizational were called public development partners and have led to improvement in quality of education. As the results of efforts taken by these government partners Shami & Hussain (2008) express that there were good changes because these interventions ensured teacher attendance was validated, facilities had improved, number of enrollments increased, and the school was successful in generating a lot of resources in the sector.

Devolution of Power and Educational Reforms

Since couple of last decade, many developing countries implemented reforms at large in in the education to meet the skilled labor force according to the need of the market. To achieve this equity in demand and supply of skilled human source the governments of respective countries significantly improved the quality of education (Robert, 2003). The main reforms, transforming the budget priorities of many countries and altering in a fundamental way the manner in which governments have traditionally made education services available and how the public sector has operated in partnership with the private sector had been introduced (Grabowski, 2004).

Expenditure Reform

The government restructures financial resources expenditures and allocation methods like allocate and manage from center or allocate spend it at lower level. These reforms aimed at increasing the supply of schooling may focus on targeted spending or the expansion of coverage in specific geographic areas through a mix of public and private sector support, including public financing with private education management in low-income areas of the country (Mark, H. E. 2017).

Financing and Managerial Reforms

There are so many related schemes those were introduced by many governments in which community communities are entirely responsible for the financing on the behalf of the government for construction and maintenance of buildings of local schools. These financing schemes may include schemes on the demand side, in which funds are channeled directly toward people who demand education rather than people who supply it to strengthen the client's power over providers (Alif Ailaan, 2018). The demand-side financing schemes are financing to the students or parents even local government who may submit their fees I the schools according to their choice (Grabowski, 2004).

Many of the courtiers introduced decentralization of management system against the centralized system is counted main reform in education. Because this a major shift in policy development and implementation according to the demographic realities of the

schools (Markov, 2004). The shift might include a simple delegation of tasks from the central government to local governments or a complete transfer of authority and decision-making power Alif Ailaan (2018). The changes may be viewed not simply as administrative adjustments, but as reforms that fundamentally alter relationships of accountability and the way in which services are provided (Grabowski, 2004).

Material and Methods

Research Design

The research design includes research philosophy, nature of research, research strategy and data collection method to develop a general framework of study. Qualitative research methods are inductive it help the researcher to investigate the experiences of individual and group of people thoroughly. Parallel to this, the research is the field research that occurs naturally, context sensitivity, direct data collection and rich narrative descriptions (Creswell, 2007). Phenomenology is known as an educational qualitative research design (Marshall & Rossman 2010; Creswell 2013; Ponce 2014). The current study is phenomenological qualitative in nature.

Population

The population of underlying study is all the representatives of education department Government of Sindh. Who possess the key responsibilities including different unit and program heads, Secretaries, District and Taluka represents parallel to different head masters having different authorities. The above discussed permanent employees working in education and literacy department government of Sindh are the population of the study.

Sample Size and Technique

For the primary data collection strategy and process of focused study, heterogeneous and purposive sampling technique was used to capture a wide range of information related to the study. The sample size was concise on fifteen respondents. All respondents of this research possess master degree with master of education, having different experience in their respective field. The participants of this phenomenological study are all the heads or representatives of different units of education and literacy department government of Sindh. The interviews were conducted from four District Education Officers, three Taluka Education Officers, one Director of School Education and one Additional director of College education; parallel to this one Principal of college, three Head Masters, one Additional Secretary of Education and representative of Sindh Reforms Support Unit (RSU) and Sindh Education Foundation (SEF) also included.

Data Collection Tool

In depth interviews were incorporated as data collection technique, whereas semi structured interviews used as tool. The research question was developed through phenomenological approach and literature of the study within the qualitative research paradigm. Every word was written verbatim and no additional or bias statement was involved in presenting the data. Interviews of the representatives were conducted individually with their permission. All interviews were digitally recorded in order to

capture verbatim language and voice inflections. The researcher transcribed the digital recordings to ensure quality.

Data Analysis

NVivo software was applied for data analysis. NVivo allows researchers to collect, organize, and analyze these varied data types. Coding data around themes is a key characteristic of qualitative research. NVivo labels these storage containers as “nodes.” Nodes can represent anything that the researcher wants them to be and grants easy organization and reorganization of themes in the data.

Results and Discussion

Introduction of School Monitoring System

Education department government of Sindh had been introduced many projects, programs and different units of administration for the effective performance, equally to make successful devolution plan. The Government of Sindh has introduced Directorate of Monitoring and Evaluation and Sindh School Monitoring System. The objective of the program is to establish a monitoring structure that improves performance and transparency of government school system. One of the components of the project was to establish schools monitoring system. In this regard the government introduced teachers monitoring system, to insure the presence of teachers in respective schools. Furthermore, the main functions of system are to monitor teachers, student's attendance in schools additionally look at the performance and reforms implementation. For this monitoring government developed unit with the name of Sindh School Monitoring System (SSMS) recruited independent monitors being monitor under the supervision of Directorate General of Monitoring and Evaluation with the help of World Bank Technical Assistance (WB TA). This system become helpful for the government to collect living data on enrolment, attendance and other key school level indicators and analyzed by independent monitors on a monthly basis. These monitors become responsible to visit the schools to check the presence of teachers and students parallel the performance of the teachers and students. Theses monitors are authorized to sit in classrooms with students during lecture of their teachers to observe the class, besides this, the monitoring officers also keep check on the funds being spent by the parents and teachers councils on repairs of school or not. By the application of biometric mechanism in this monitoring system government identified more than 1500 teachers who were expired. Despite of all these positive indicators of this monitoring system one of the District Education Officer identified the negativities of the program he said that “the various qualitative and senior teachers decided to leave the job before reach to the time of retirement because of some complexities of the program”. Because of strictness and misbehave of monitors many teachers resigned.

Girls' Stipends (GS)

Gender equality is very essential issue in developing countries, since last few decades, equity has emerged as a sensitive, social issue especially in education. To attract the girl's student's enrolment government decided to provide annual stipends from class 6th to 10th. In the year 2014-15 ATM cards were distributed to girls' students. Deputy Secretary added about the government based support provided to the girls of rural areas

of the province that “the School Education and Literacy Department Government of Sindh, gives annual stipend to encourage female education. An amount of Rs.1500 million has been reserved for 275,000 female students during the 2015-16 academic year, 280,000 for the 2016-17 academic years and onward. This initiative is reflective of Government of Sindh’s commitment to increase the enrolment of girls in schools at the secondary level. One of the EDO identified some weaknesses of these stipends that “most of the rural population does not have CNIC or B forms and ATM cards parallel to this access to the banks; hence the distribution of stipends is questionable. Government faces the pressure of national and international organizations to enhance enrolment ratio in the province and introduced such program but it could not succeeded to boost the enrolment in schools of rural areas.

Public Private Partnership to Run the Schools in Rural Areas

Government in school education sector has introduced a distinct node dedicated for the program of Public Private Partnership to surge the access and improve the quality of educational services with the help of private partners. In this model government tried to ensure the access of student of marginalized areas on quality of education. To achieve these objectives the government introduced various programs and packages under the Sindh Education Foundation (SEF), SEF provides different charges per child every month to the schools. For the female enrolment enhancement SEF pays more amounts for female students to the school every month in areas where grave gender biases prevail. One of the participants from SEF believed that “the public and private partnerships can encourage sustainable reforms at the grassroots to ensure quality of education in addition to provision of access”. Furthermore for to ensure quality, SEF assumes a series of incorporated and modified service for its partners which basically include general capacity building of teachers and head teachers, classroom level support. More than this, Sindh Education Foundation (SEF) provides free textbooks, learning aids, additionally regular school support visits and monitoring, training of school operators or heads for effective school management and school leadership. Moreover (SEF) helps out to schools in assessment of learning outcomes and teachers’ performance, provision of matching grants in establishment of science, computer labs in different schools according to the need.

Standardized Achievement Test (SAT)

Education and literacy department government of Sindh has initiated Standardized Achievement Test (SAT) to assess the students’ performance. In this regard in the year 2012-13 to assess the achievement level of students of class V to VIII on the pattern of assessment process government introduced a program to assess the students of public sector school. Initially government handed over this contract Sukkur IBA University and later this test was conducted by Directorate of Curriculum The representative of Reform Support Unit mentioned that “the Government of Sindh initiated standardized testing in Sindh under SAT (Standardized Achievement Test) Project for class V and VIII students studying in all government schools in order to measure the quality of educational standards”.

Education Management System

It is difficult for the teachers to teach and manage the affairs of the school, the government introduced new model with the name of Education Management (EM). This model of education management introduced in education department to separate teaching and administrative cadres in order to strengthen both the fields so that there is efficiency in the system and desired results are achieved. Regarding this one of the Head Teachers identified that “this initiative could create and maintain a positive environment in schools. By this the teaching staff totally engaged to enrich their respective profession”. TEO (Talka Education Officer) mentioned that including management of school are enthusiastic and optimistic about their newly learned strategies and skills in their own teaching and management”. Whereas it is anticipating the potential challenges during implementation phase.

Establishment of Reform Support Unit

No doubt RSU established in 2006 before the devolution of power however, it has initiated many wings and programs after 18th Constitutional Amendment. This unit provides platform for the donor coordination as measure to synchronize different donors’ resources and efforts in consolidated vision of educational excellence. The Unit’s areas of expertise are design activity framework and implementation strategy along with SOP’s, data collection, data analysis and its institutionalized impacts on policy and strategy as well as coordination of policy and its implementation. The representative of RSU mentioned that “the Reform Support Unit (RSU) - Sindh was conceptualized as a means to build the institutional capability of the Department of Education”. The main justification of this program is to incorporate resources of education delivery, equally provide policy inputs for improvement of education growth in terms of governance, access and quality education.

Teacher’s Development

All aspects of teacher education such as recruitment, promotion and teacher rationalization need to be integrated into a comprehensive framework. In response to NEP 2009, the Government of Sindh (GoS) developed the Teacher Education and Development (TED) Policy 2009 to guide reforms in the four areas like, rationalizing the roles of Provincial Institute of Teachers Education (PITE), Initial Teacher Education (ITE) or pre-service teacher education; Continuous Professional Development (CPD) of teachers or in-service teacher education; and establishment of a focal institution or Apex body for supervision of all matters of teachers development in the province. Because of these all steps and policy documents still the teachers are poorly aware about the aims and objectives of curriculum reforms in the education sector of the province. In the province teacher is too away from the curriculum development process. There is not any communication and feedback system is present by which the teacher suggests or shares any information with curriculum developing experts. Most of the teachers know that our responsibility is to teach just text books and no responsible more. Without few senior teachers or those who are involved in politics like teachers unions about the policy or documents of the reforms in the sector.

Curriculum Framework in School Education

The curriculum is known as the constitution of education system, it provides bases for the entire learning experiences and assessment to know the outcomes of these experiences. The curriculum provides the basis for the assessment that how much student focused on competency based development. How much student developed critical thinking and problem solving abilities after a spent of a year in the class room? In public sector education system, mostly the curriculum is understood and represented through textbooks; equally the curriculum has implications for the assessment process, having inappropriate linkages between assessment and the curriculum. More than this, the associations in the process of assessing student learning outcomes, shapes the path of teacher's professional development and learning process. In the curriculum development process of Sindh province there is no coherence among these three units, curriculum development, teachers preparedness according to that curriculum and assessment. After the 18th Amendment the provinces are responsible for all matters related to education policy, curriculum, syllabus planning and textbook development, centers of excellence and standards of education including madersa education. In this regard the government modified and updated the curriculum wing in directorate with the name of Directorate of Curriculum, Assessment and Research (DCAR). The directorate updated curriculum till the primary and middle, with proper assessment and teacher's development according to the needs of developed curriculum. However, the functions of directorate are underneath uncertainty because of single curriculum program at national level designed by federal government.

The impact of most recent school closures almost in the world, it has become immediately clear that the children at risk of dropping out in the educational institutes and those who are likely to experience the most significant learning losses are the ones from marginalized backgrounds. Pakistan has an estimated 22.8 million children age of five to 16 years outside school. The ongoing COVID-19 pandemic and consequent school closures have resulted in millions more deprived of learning opportunities. According to the figures of 2017-18 more than 6 million children are out of school in province of Sindh. However, ASER report 2019 explicates similar situation rather than betterment owing to the Sindh Government prerogatives.

This situation will be worsening due to the continue closures of schools since March last year. According to the ASER 2019, 26% in government and 35% students of private school can read at least a sentence in English. These students were promoted in upper classes due to pandemic without any proper schooling and assessment. Despite a gap of more than one and half year in schooling this big ratio of the students cannot survive further and compete resultantly turnout ratio will increase in primary as well as secondary schools and out of the school children number will increase. Besides this, poor infrastructure, accountability and commitment in institutions handover the devolution program to failure.

Conclusion

Since the commencement of No Child Left behind (NCLB), the leaders in the field of education collectively have many responsibilities in the area of governance and

accountability. They should to ensure that without any difference of language, color and culture each child should be able to qualify assessment test developed according to the standards of the region, that's basic of universal education. To achieve this basic universal education, equally fourth objective of Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) the educational leaders must develop a comparative education setup that help to educate planers to plan and design standards for school leaders, instruction, appropriate professional development of teachers, ways to support school leaders to change in mission. Parallel, develop new program for early childhood, school and class size and ensure school enrollment. To ensure universal education, globally increasing concept of philosophy of globalization and neo secularism economy also attempting social inequalities and establishing a literate community which can keep pace with the world has become essential to sale education as goods. In this regard Government of Sindh has introduced various reforms and new trends like objectives and policy pillars, better government schools, improved learning outcomes and increased and improved funding in the education sector Sindh government has so far been unable to effectively use its resources to implement effective governance system which provides quality and sustained education in the province. Besides the above discussed issues, very current millions of the students are promoted in upper classes due to pandemic without any proper schooling and assessment. Despite a gap of more than one and half year in schooling this big ratio of the students cannot survive further and compete resultantly turnout ratio will increase in primary as well as secondary schools and out of the school children number will increase.

Recommendations

Government should to enhance enrolment in the school of distance areas still more than 26% students of age 5 to16 years are still out of school. Equally, government immediate took actions to sling the children at risk of dropping out and those who are likely to experience the most significant learning losses due to continues closure of schools due to pandemic. Poverty, gender and location are intersecting to entrench exclusion for already-marginalized children.

References

- Bardhan, P., (2002). Decentralization of Governance and Development. Source: *The Journal of Economic Perspectives*, Vol. 16, p. 185-205
- Falleti, G.T., (2005). A Sequential Theory of Decentralization: Latin American Cases in Comparative Perspective. Source: *The American Political Science Review*, Vol. no. 99
- Gibton, D. & Goldring, (2001). The Role of Legislation in Educational Decentralization: The Case of Israel and Britain. Source: *Peabody Journal of Education*, Vol. 76, pp. 81-101.
- Gibton. D. & Goldring. E. (2001). The Role of Legislation in Educational Decentralization: The Case of Israel and Britain. *Peabody Journal of Education*, Vol. 76, No. ¾, 81-101
- Mark, H. E. (2017). Decentralization and Regionalization in Educational Administration: Comparisons of Venezuela, Colombia and Spain. Source: *Comparative Education*, Vol. 25, No. 1 41-55.
- Miron, G., & Nelson, C. (2002). *What's public about charter schools? Lessons learned about choice and accountability*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin
- Mithani, M. M., (2003). Enhancing institutional capacity building of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and community based organizations (CBOs): Impact of an innovative initiative. *Impact: Making a difference*, 265-277.
- Oates (2005). Towards a second generation theory of fiscal federalism. *International Tax and Public Finance* 12 (4):349-373.
- Reynolds .R., (2008). New Labour, Education and Wales: The Devolution Decade. Source, *Oxford Review of Education*, Vol. 34, No. 6, 753-765
- Self, P. (2012). Educational Leadership Approaches and Trends. Source: *Education Journal*. Vol. 1, No. 1, 2012, pp. 9-14.
- Walberg, J., Pak, J. & et. al., (2000). Decentralization and International Perspective; *Educational Horizon*, Vol.78. Accessed from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable>